

The Effect of Patriarchy Towards Women's Oppression of Freedom in *Enola Holmes: The Case of The Missing Marquess* By Nancy Springer

Sava Anindya Anugerah Putri
Universitas Balikpapan
savaanindyaap@gmail.com

Siti Hafisah
Universitas Balikpapan
siti.hafisah@uniba-bpn.ac.id

Abstract:

*This research aims to analyze the effect of patriarchy towards the oppression of women's freedom in the novel *Enola Holmes: The Case of The Missing Marquess*. The theory used in this research is the theory of feminism specifically liberal feminism proposed by Mary Wollstonecraft. The method used in this research is a descriptive qualitative research method. The researcher found that there are several forms of oppression of women's freedom based on forms of patriarchy, such as public and private patriarchy. The oppression such as, the oppression of freedom in the form of Education, Voting Rights, and Individual Rights. The oppression was dominant happened in private patriarchy form. Those oppression resulted a women's resistance from women who wanted to resist the patriarchal actions experienced by the female character in this object research.*

Keywords: *Liberal Feminism, Patriarchy, Freedom, Women's Oppression, Women's Resistance*

INTRODUCTION

Nowadays, the world is getting more advanced, with human thinking that is supposed to become wider over time. Humans between men and women should be respectful to each other. However, until now, a system is still often used as an act or ideology to underestimate women, commonly known as patriarchy. A patriarchal system is where men are not giving

voice and value to women's opinions, responses, and writings. They have suppressed the female, devalued, devalued, and trivialized what it means to be a woman.

The oppression of women by patriarchy will continue to be experienced by women. Oppression often occurs from a narrow environment to a wider one. As stated by Oakley in (M & N, 2018, p.1), he argued that "The history of women discrimination and oppression arises from the human formation where women lost points to males because of biological makeup which entails masculinity and femininity. In addition to the form of patriarchy that oppresses women's freedom, it finally affects women namely women take a form of resistance to defend their choice for their good of themselves. In this study, the researcher will use a liberal feminism theory because the female character in this novel struggle for her freedom against a patriarchal treatment who wants to control her freedom, especially in education and how to dress up because of her gender, how patriarchy gives a picture to be a real woman in society.

The researcher chose this object to try to apply the theory of liberal feminism according to Mary Wollstonecraft with the problem formulation which the researcher found in this object. The researcher wants to give an understanding of liberal feminism. Thus, it can be seen that there is a form of women's resistance because of the women's oppression experienced by the female characters who fight for their freedom rights against patriarchal actions carried out by men. There are also the researcher wanted this research could provide an understanding of the patriarchal forms.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Feminism is an umbrella word for various approaches, thought that explain oppression against women and find a way to undermine or eliminate the oppression of women. Therefore, the essence of contemporary feminism is the struggle to achieve equality, dignity, and freedom of women to choose in managing their lives and bodies, both inside and outside of domestic life. A political movement that reviews many aspects of human life, the most important of which is the injustice that women have long suffered, is also called feminism. By the time, feminism is not just a discourse but an ideology whose essence is resistance, and free from domination, oppression, injustice, and violence against women by the patriarchal system.

Liberal Feminism by Mary Wollstonecraft

Mary Wollstonecraft argues in the book a vindication of the right women that women and men should have an equal chance, either the economy or education. Liberal feminist thought originated from the existence of women's rights and freedom to determine their own lives, such as being shackled or restrained. Even at that time, the state restricted every woman under the pretext of protecting women. However, women did not get their full freedom because of this thought.

“It is time to effect a revolution in female manners, time to restore to them their lost dignity, and make them, as a part of the human species, labour by reforming themselves to reform the world. It is time to separate unchangeable morals from local manners.” (Wollstonecraft, 2019, p.67)

As stated by the quote, the researcher thinks that is due to the existence of a patriarchal system which is still very common. Feminism theoretically referred to the equality of men and women and became the beginning of the women's movement to obtain their rights. This flow is called liberal feminism because it focuses on the importance of individual freedom regarding the rights obtained and the obligations carried out.

Wollstonecraft argues that women are naturally not inferior to men, but it seems that women have little education. Therefore, Wollstonecraft expressed his disapproval of the public view at the time, which said that the natural condition of women caused women to lack the same intellectual and physical abilities as men.

Wollstonecraft fights for women's rights as quoted in Susanti's thesis, (2014, p. 52) to have equal rights with men in the fields of politics, education, and employment. She did this in the purpose that women are not called motherhood because they are only confined to the house and do housework, and women are not just tools or instruments for the pleasure, happiness, and perfection of men. Therefore, Mary Wollstonecraft believes that by not distinguishing kind of education between women and men, women are able to become independent women and not depending herself on men.

Patriarchy

Patriarchy becomes the role of women to be oppressed in the public space of society as in the educational space, politics, home, and even the economy field. Patriarchy is a social system that believes that men are more potential than women. In any of the historical forms said that patriarchal society takes whether it is feudal, capitalist, or socialist, a sex-gender system and economic discrimination operate simultaneously. The main issue of patriarchy is that men are controlled over women's labor power

As patriarchy explained as well above, it related to the state of Walby;

“...I shall define patriarchy as a system of social structures and practices in which men dominate, oppress and exploit women. The use of the term social structure is important here since it clearly implies rejection both of biological determinism and the notion that every individual man is in a dominant position and every woman in a subordinate one.” (Walby, 1990, p. 20)

As experienced by the main character in this researched Novel, Mycroft holmes, try to dominate his younger sister and manage Enola under the excuse that Enola can become a real woman. Moreover, feminism appears because of men's unfair treatment toward women in society, and it is called patriarchy. Walby argues that the forms of patriarchy in the social world are divided into two distinctive forms, which are:

1. Private patriarchy

Private patriarchy occurs in a household as a form of the female stereotype. Private patriarchy is based upon household production, with a patriarch controlling women individually and directly in a relatively private sphere at home. Women who work in the household are like women must wash, cook, and take care of their children. Private patriarchy sees one individual patriarch who is the dominant male-dominated and oppresses the subjugated female. These acts make Walby believe it is a tactic as women are prevented from taking part in public discourse.

2. Public patriarchy

Public patriarchy is based on a structure other than the household, although this may still be a significant patriarchal site. Public patriarchy is based on public sites such as employment and the state. Institutions conventionally regarded as part of the public domain are central in maintaining patriarchy. This form operates in public, often associated with the working world. The existence of oppressive factors that still function in society is also called as public patriarchy. Walby argues that women are more collectively separated from any forms in public life, power, wealth, and influence, than men.

Women's Resistance

The researcher found the impact of the patriarchal system in this research, presenting resistance from female figures regarding the oppression of the freedom of women who are threatened by this patriarchal system. Women fought for inequality between men and women to have an equal right position as men have.

The analysis will be related to the explanation of liberal feminism by Mary Wollstonecraft.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This research uses a descriptive qualitative research method because the researcher uses several pieces of the data conversation such as dialogue and narration from the novel *"Enola Holmes: The Case of The Missing Marquess"* by Nancy Springer which in the form of words to describe the analysis. The researcher needs a data source to use as a reference and additional information. The first is primary data, the main object of this research is the novel *"Enola Holmes: The Case of The Missing Marquess"* by Nancy Springer which published in 2006. The second is secondary data, the researcher used several journal articles, books, other people's thesis, and official websites relevant to this research to be a source of reference and additional information in analyzing this research.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Forms of Patriarchy

As defined by Sylvia, men dominate, oppress and exploit women as a system of social structures and practices. In this discussion, the researcher will explain how the forms of patriarchy according to Sylvia Walby towards women oppression shown in the novel *Enola Holmes*. As explained in the theoretical review, the forms of patriarchy are divided into two, namely public and private patriarchy.

1. Public Patriarchy

Public patriarchy is a form of patriarchy which as explained in the theory that public patriarchy is based principally in public sites such as employment and the state. Public patriarchy caused the existence of oppressive factors which still function in society. According to Walby's explanation, this form of patriarchy occurs outside the home environment. The public patriarchy that occurs in this novel is experienced by female character namely Enola, where her older brother oppresses her freedom outside the home which related to the social life with a lot of people in a state. There are patriarchal actions in public, such as underestimating women's abilities outside the house.

a. Women's Oppression in Education of Public Patriarchy

The oppression of women is one of the issues related to patriarchy. One of the main goals of liberal feminism according to Mary Wollstonecraft is to realize the existence of equal education for men and women. Women should also have the same opportunities and rights to do everything that generally according to the patriarch which several things only can be done by men.

The quotation below shows how Mycroft gave some critics to his sister, namely Enola Holmes.

“what is to become of you if you do not acquire some accomplishments, some social graces, some finish? You will never be able to move in polite society, and your prospects of matrimony—” (p.68A)

In the quote, it can be seen that Mycroft assumes that if his younger sister, Enola, have no any achievements or accomplishments through the quote “*do not acquire some accomplishments*”, then he thought that Enola will never be able to move in the polite society, and this will have an impact on her marriage prospects. When Mycroft relating marriage, it was the same as the more Enola accomplished as well the easier it was to find a partner. This is as stated by Walby which said that patriarchy is that men feel dominant over women.

In this case, it has an impact on Enola's life outside the house, because she mentions how she moves in the general public so that it is included in the public patriarchy. Liberal feminist, Mary Wollstonecraft assumes that whatever a woman does must be in accordance with what she wants because it is for her own benefit and their good. Also, that is the goal of liberal feminism to get their individual. Women should have as many opportunities to succeed in the public sphere as men in any field and in their way. Women also have their right for freedom as human being.

The researcher concludes that there was a patriarchal act carried out by Mycroft regarding how Enola's accomplishments as a woman were considered non-existent just because she did not want to obey what Mycroft asked to go to boarding school as suggested by her older brother. In this case men feels superior than women, thus, when he finds out that his younger sister is not getting the education as well he expected, he concludes that his younger sister will not be able to move in society. The researcher concludes that patriarchal action in this case is there is an idea that women who do not have a proper education will not be able to move in a broad social life. Then, it becomes possible that women also have no right to vote or give their opinion in society.

b. Women's Oppression in Voting Rights of Public Patriarchy

Voting rights is one of the issues of oppression by patriarchy against women which is one of the focuses of liberal feminism. Women and men should have the same opportunity to express their voting rights, in order to achieve a good purpose, either at home or in public field especially in state field. Each individual should not be biased in accepting opinions, and all must be balanced and follow the existing reality.

The quotation below will explain how Enola thinks about the things her mother has gone through while experiencing things caused by patriarchy.

“yet there it was: she had been weak as well as strong. She had felt as trapped as I did. She had felt the injustice of her situation just as keenly. She had been forced to obey, as I would be forced to obey. She had wanted to rebel, as I desperately yearned to rebel, without knowing how I ever would or could. But in the end, she had managed it. Glorious rebellion.” (p.72)

In the quotation, Enola explains what her mother has gone through she is also going through now, it can be seen through the quotation “*she had been forced to obey, as I would be forced to obey*” Enola was forced by Mycroft, her brother in different cases, in order to Enola to be the young women, she should be at that time. Her mother had also felt the injustice in voting rights field, forced to obey her current situation, but her mother managed to overcome it also with glorious rebellion.

In this quote, the researcher concludes that the act of patriarchy will indeed continue to be experienced by women, especially in the public sphere. As stated by Mary Wollstonescraft she fights for women's right to have an equal right with men in the fields of politics in voting right. Her mother has already moved to fight against women's oppression and does whatever she wants. This movement carried out by the female characters in this novel is related to women's freedom namely the suffragette movement, therefore it is included in liberal feminism. The oppression of freedom of women became the background of the existence of liberal feminism that wanted the liberation of women from the restrained of patriarchy. Women's oppression is an action that is done by men against women in the field of the patriarchal system.

c. Women's Oppression in Individual Rights of Public Patriarchy

Regarding the issue of patriarchy, men should respect women's choices and should not underestimate the ability of women in every aspect. Because, the purpose of feminism is that women have the same opportunities and rights as men, thus, women's freedom are not constrained and can have aspirations in society also they are free to make their own choices without any control from others.

The quotation below will explain the existence of patriarchal act in the form of oppression of human right, where a woman must wear the clothes that many other women wore at that time.

“or your gloves?” Sherlock chided, taking me by the arm and steering me towards the station.

“or decent, decorous clothing of any sort? You're a young lady now, Enola”
(p.34A)

In the quote above, it can be seen that besides Enola's hair, there is something in Enola which got complain and critic by her brothers. According to Mycroft, as in men's view Enola as a young woman should look like other young women at that time. It was seen that there was a standard of dress for women, there were terms and condition in dressing for women outside the house, through the quotation “*decorous clothing of any sort*”. The oppression experienced by the female characters in the quote above is a negative and demeaning view of men towards women who wearing clothes but did not match the clothes worn by other women.

The researcher concludes that, there is oppression of women's freedom in the public sphere carried out by male characters related to how women dress which still have to follow the social environment and men, rather than according to the desires of women themselves. In fact, for liberal feminists, women's freedom should not be limited anymore, women can choose according to what they want. Women can use what makes them comfortable, and also the existence of statement as in the quote “*you're a young lady*”, it points to something which Enola is obliged to do as a women.

2. Private Patriarchy

Private patriarchy as explained above, according to Sylvia Walby occurs in household production or domestic field, with a patriarch controlling and oppress women individually and directly in a relatively private sphere at home. In private patriarchy, there are patriarch whose dominant male, they dominated and oppresses the subjugated female.

a. Women's Oppression in Education of Private Patriarchy

One of the main goals of liberal feminism according to Mary Wollstonecraft is to realize the existence of equal education for men and women. Women should also have the same opportunities and rights to do everything that generally according to the patriarch which several things only can be done by men.

In the quotation below there are patriarchal actions carried out by Mycroft by dominated all the activities his younger sister has to do.

“there is no denying that we have been woefully deceived.”

“—and for Enola, a music teacher, a dancing instructor, a governess—” (p. 45A)

Mycroft already has strategy for Enola through the quotation “—and for Enola, a music teacher, a dancing instructor, a governess—” he wanted to give Enola a music teacher, dancing instructor and a governess for teaching and taking care of his younger sister, however, her mother did not do as Mycroft wanted towards Enola, she does not have any of that. In the quote above, the researcher concludes that the existence of the patriarchal act above is that her older brother is trying to control Enola’s life and activities, by arranging the things which have to be done by Enola.

Related to this, as Walby said that patriarchy is a practice in controlling women, such as the patriarchal society deeming appropriate for women only those jobs related to the traditional feminine personality, such as nursing, teaching, and childcare. Mary Wollstonecraft said that the goal of liberal feminism is to free women from men’s control. Therefore, Mary wants women to be able to do all activities not only feminine but masculine as long as she is able to do it. Moreover, this is closely related to the impact of patriarchy on women’s oppression of freedom.

b. Women’s Oppression in Individual Rights of Private Patriarchy

Patriarchy is a system that assumes men are superior than women. It causes men to feel free to have the right and power to control several things which women do. Women as an individual can not feel free to make their own choices because of the control and oppression of by men.

The dominating act by male in the house can be seen in the quotation below.

“as I am the first born son, the estate is mine he went on and mother did not dispute that, but she could not seem to see why she should not manage things for me, rather than the other way around. When Sherlock and I reminded her that, legally, she had no right even to live here unless I permitted it, she became quite irrational and made it clear that we were no longer welcome in our own birth place”(p.48)

In the quote above, it can be seen Mycroft as the first son, all decisions depend on him through the quotation “*When Sherlock and I reminded her that, legally, she had no right even to live here unless I permitted it,*”. Then he also said that he and Sherlock had reminded his mother that his mother had no right, even to live in their house if Mycroft didn’t allow it to be the head of the family since his father died and because of that his mother was considered irrational so Mycroft felt he was not in the house where he lived, he was born.

In the quote above, the researcher concludes that there is patriarchal actions in private carried out by Mycroft as a man who feels superior in their family as a substitute for his father. As stated by Sylvia Walby, private patriarchy is controlling women individually and directly at home. Also, there is patriarchal thought that the level of women is below men, therefore, women must obey the men who is at home. In this case the female characters should follow the rules of the men character.

Woman's Resistance as the effect of patriarchy

In this discussion, the researcher will explain how the patriarchal system effect toward women's oppression of freedom in the novel Enola Holmes. The researcher finds several effect, namely women's resistance according to Mary (Wollstonecraft, 2019, p.67) female manners need to a revolution, and time to restore the dignity, time to reforming themselves to reform the world . In this research, the researcher found the existence of women's resistance toward the oppression of freedom by the patriarch, which was divided into several problems, namely women's resistance in education, voting rights and determining choices.

1. Woman's Resistance in Education

The oppression carried out by the patriarchy against women in the field of education resulted in resistance by women, this is a feminist movement to achieve individual freedom in the field of education. Education is one of the goals of liberal feminism, which demands equality of education between women and men. According to Walby (Walby, 1990, p. 146) the resistance of women verbally and physically, sometimes women are arguing and fighting back, sometimes they side-stepping and deflecting, or sometimes they are simply hanging on to life itself. Freedom to get a proper education, many people agree that education is very important and must be obtained by every human being.

The quotation below shows Enola's usual activities to get knowledge by reading some books.

“I have read Shakespeare I replied “and Aristotle, and Locke and the novels of Thackeray and the essays of Mary Wollstonecraft” (p. 46)

It can be seen from the quote that Enola explains that she has read several books through the caption “*I have read Shakespeare I replied..*” such as Shakespeare, Aristotle, Locke, Thackeray and Essays by Mary Wollstonecraft. The way she is reading an essay of Mary Wollstonecraft this is kind of clue that she was also studying the rights of women's freedom to be achieved in liberal feminism She explained this to inform to her brother that she had received lessons other than outside the usual public school.

In the quote above, the researcher concludes that there is a women's resistance from a female character, namely Enola who defends herself regarding the knowledge she has as a teenage girl who does not attend school. As stated by Mary Wollstonecraft that there is equality between men and women. Therefore, women also have the opportunity to explore their abilities in all fields, not only stuffs that are considered only women can do.

2. Woman's Resistance in Voting Rights

Freedom also applies in terms of voting rights, because women and men should have the same opportunity to express their voting rights. In this research, the researcher found a women's movement known as the suffragette where a group of women who demand equal rights of women to get the right to vote. Each individual should not be biased in accepting opinions, and all must be balanced and follow the existing reality that women can also raise their voice to vote.

The quotation below shows the description of Enola's mother as a member of feminist movement at that time.

“mom was, you see, very much a free thinker, a woman of character, a proponent of female suffrage and dress reform including the soft, loose, aesthetic gowns advocated by ruskin but als, whether she liked it or not, she was a squire’s widow, with certain obligations.” (p.21)

In the quote can be seen that Enola describes how her mother is a great thinker through the quotation “*mom was, you see, very much a free thinker,*”, part of the female suffragette group, she is also a widow who has many obligations, and how she dressed up looks like including the soft, loose, aesthetic gowns advocated by ruskin but als shether she liked it or not. Suffragette is a female group whose goal is to voice women’s right to express their opinion in public.

Based on the quotation, the researcher concludes as the explanation that has been discussed above, liberal feminists are wanting justice and equality in speaking in public, both men and women, because women also have an opinion for the state. As well by joining the suffragette, Enola’s mother is fighting against patriarchy related to voting rights. Liberal feminist wanted women to be able to voice their opinions, and voting rights in public spaces, thus women can have an aspirations in society, it is in line with Mary Wollstonecraft.

3. Woman’s Resistance in Individual Rights

The oppression carried out by the patriarchy against women in the field of determining choices resulted in resistance by women, this is a feminist movement to achieve individual freedom in the field of determining their choices. The main goal of liberal feminism is women are free from being restrained and also can make their own choices. Determining choices is the freedom of every individual should have. In determining choices, each individual should be able to choose for themselves without any forced and control from other.

Through the quotation below, Enola affirmed that her brother could not force her go to boarding school.

“I raised my voice. “no, get me a governess if you must, but I am not going to any so-called boarding school. You cannot make me go.” (p. 69)

It can be seen through “*You cannot make me go.*” that Enola denies her brother to forced her to go to a boarding school for young woman. Enola began to show her dislike by raising her voice. He gave up, and allowed herself to obey to be given a governess. Enola fought back saying that her brother couldn’t make her go.

Also from the quote above, the researcher concludes, this is a fight as a resistance against the oppression of women’s freedom by men. Enola thought that it was fine for her to get a governess but she wouldn’t go anywhere called boarding school. Enola also insists that her older brother can’t make her go. Enola keeps trying to convince to Mycroft of this point.

The resistance of Enola, represented what Sylvia Walby said that the resistance of women verbally and physically could by arguing. Enola shows how she was arguing with her brother, while talking about the boarding school for Enola.

CONCLUSION

The conclusion of this research based on the finding and discussion of the research. The researcher was analysing this object research using liberal feminism by Mary Wollstonecraft. It used to find the relationship between the effect of patriarchy towards women's oppression of freedom which called women's resistance with the point of view of liberal feminism. Also, to answer the first research question, the researcher was identifying use patriarchy according Sylvia Walby, grouping the patriarchal actions according to the form which has been divided into two, namely public and private patriarchy. The form of patriarchy in this research is the oppression of women's freedom experienced by women's characters in several fields found by the researcher public and private field, namely oppression in education, voting rights and individual rights. Then, the effect of oppression resulted in women's resistance related to the oppression experienced by female character, as a form of female character defending her individual freedom rights as women. In this research, the dominants form of patriarchy which shown is private patriarchy, especially in education field. The oppression of women is carried out by patriarchy, which occurs in the smallest circle of female characters, which is by her older brother. The oppression that occurred was related to female character's education which was arranged by male character, Whereas a female character named Enola was forced to carry out special education in a women boarding school by her older brother, also her choices as an individual were limited only because she is a women and still has to be regulated by her brother because he is not sure about Enola's ability or independent thinking as a women. From those things, it can be seen that there are form of oppression of freedom against women.

References

- M, D., & N, L. (2018). Discrimination and Oppression of Women: A Social Work Exploration in Zimbabwe. *Sociology and Criminology-Open Access*, 06(02). <https://doi.org/10.35248/2375-4435.18.6.185>
- Springer, N. (2006). *Enola Holmes; The Case of The Missing Marquess*. Puffin Books.
- Susanti. (2014). *Feminisme dalam Perspektif Husein Muhammad*.
- Walby, S. (1990). *1990_Walby_Theorising_Patriarchy_book_Blackwell.pdf* (p. 229). Basil Blackwell Ltd.
- Wollstonecraft, M. (2019). *The Feminist Papers - A Vindication of the Rights of Women*. Gibbs Smith.